MEETING OF THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS
23 November, 1976

AM
10:00 *CONVENE, 708 Jackson Place, N.W., Washington, D.C.*

ADMINISTRATION

A. Dates of next meetings: 21 December, 1976
18 January, 1976

B. Minutes of October 1976 meeting.

C. 1919 F Street, N.W., George Washington University/World Bank Project - Status Report.

D. 2000 Block of I Street, N.W., Landmark Designation - Report.

SUBMISSIONS-REVIEWS

A. Smithsonian Institution

National Air and Space Museum, Installation of "Delta Solar" - Site Revisions.

B. D.C. Department of Economic Development

Old Georgetown Act

1. OG 77-18, 3000 M Street, N.W., Hotel/Office/Commercial Building - Resubmission.

2. OG 77-19, 3231 Prospect Street, N.W., Residential/Office/Retail Project - Resubmission.

3. OG 77-21, 3210 Grace Street, N.W., Renovation and Addition to Existing Buildings for Restaurant and Retail Use - Resubmission.

4. OG 77-26, 1049 30th Street, N.W., Inn and Office/Apartment Building - Resubmission.

5. OG 77-27, 1623 Wisconsin Avenue, N.W., Demolition of Existing Structure and Replacement with Three-Story Commercial Structure.

6. OG 77-28, 2800 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W., Hotel/ Office/Commercial Building - Final Designs and Material Samples.

7. OG 77-29, 3222 M Street, N.W. (Rear), 3248 M Street, N.W. (Rear), 1070 Wisconsin Avenue, N.W., Demolition of Existing Structures.

8. OG 77- , Georgetown University Field House - Preliminary Designs.

9. Appendix 1.

Shipstead-Luce Act

Appendix 2.

C. D.C. Department of Housing and Community Development

Historic Subdivisions

Appendix 3.

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS
23 November, 1976

The meeting convened at 10:10 a.m. in the Commission of Fine Arts offices at 708 Jackson Place, N.W., Washington, D.C.

Members Present:	*Hon. J. Carter Brown, Chairman*
	Hon. Victorine du Pont Homsey
	Hon. Frederick D. Nichols
	Hon. Kevin Roche
	Hon. George A. Weymouth
Staff Present:	*Mr. Charles H. Atherton, Secretary*
	Mr. Donald B. Myer, Assistant Secretary
	Miss Lynda L. Brown
	Mr. J. L. Sibley Jennings, Jr.
	Mrs. Sue A. Kohler
	Mrs. Nancy N. Lusher
National Capital Planning Commission Staff Present:	*Mr. Robert Gresham*

I. ADMINISTRATION

A. Dates of next meetings, approved as: 21 December 1976
18 January 1977.

B. Minutes of October 1976 meeting, approved.

C. 1919 F Street, N.W., George Washington University/World Bank Project - Status Report. The Assistant Secretary reported that a new scheme had been presented to the Joint Committee on Landmarks whereby the facades of the G Street townhouses would be saved but the buildings themselves demolished and replaced by new construction, the whole to be erected at sidewalk grade without the present basement story. The Landmarks Committee was not happy with this solution nor with the large mass of the new building, and so advised the Planning Commission, which has not yet considered the project.

D. 2000 Block of I Street, N.W., Landmarks Designation - Report. The members were informed that the Landmarks Committee had tentatively approved the designation, pending resolution of some legal problems raised by the Foley Company, owners of some of the structures.

II. SUBMISSIONS-REVIEWS

A. Smithsonian Institution

National Air and Space Museum, Installation of "Delta Solar" - Site revision. The Secretary told the members that the sculptor had asked that his work be rotated 45 degrees from the position previously approved by the Commission so that it would catch more afternoon sunlight. The members unanimously agreed to approve this change in orientation. Exhibit A.

B. D.C. Department of Economic Development

Old Georgetown Act

1. OG 77-18, 3000 M Street, N.W., Hotel/Office/Commercial Building - Resubmission. The Assistant Secretary explained that this project, previously approved, had been revised because some parcels of land included in the original project were now unavailable for purchase. The M Street building would have to be shorter and a section in the middle of the block eliminated. The revised design was presented to the Georgetown Board members who asked again that wood sash be used on the windows, at least on the lower buildings facing M and 30th Streets, and stressed that the project must not exceed zoning limitations.

The Commission questioned the two-story, 20-foot penthouse, disguised with "Colonial" windows to look like part of the hotel space. The developer, Mr. Al Wheeler, said he was within the 60-foot height permitted, but the Chairman reminded him that under the Old Georgetown Act the Commission of Fine Arts could recommend a height lower than that permitted by zoning. Suggestions were made as to how the height of this penthouse might be reduced, and Mr. Wheeler agreed to restudy the problem and make a resubmission. The D.C. Government was advised, "Do not issue permit."

2. OG 77-19, 3231 Prospect Street, N.W., Residential/Office/Retail Project - Resubmission. The Assistant Secretary told the members that the revised design for this project showed the building on Prospect Street lowered by one floor with the height now approximately 40 feet, as recommended by the Commission. He added that this version had been approved by the Georgetown Board. Mr. Tobey, the architect from Metcalf Associates, explained how space lost because of the height reduction had been redistributed into the eastern section of the building on Prospect Street, into a side yard, and other areas throughout the project.

Mr. Loren Kieve, a resident of the area, spoke next and said that he did not believe the new design complied with the Commission's recommendations regarding either height or massing. He showed small cardboard models of two buildings, one 30 feet high and one

40, which he said could be built on the Prospect Street frontage and would give the developer the same amount of space as the taller buildings proposed. He was concerned that the underground parking might cause the death of street trees on the block and also noted that the number of parking spaces to be provided was not sufficient.

Mr. Grosvenor Chapman, representing the Advisory Neighborhood Commission, siad he had changed his position, and was now convinced by Mr. Kieve that the 40-foot height should not only be an apparent cornice height from Prospect Street but should be a limit to the actual scope of the project. He said two or three stories is the average height of Georgetown buildings, and letting this project go much higher would set an unfortunate precedent.

The members discussed Mr. Kieve's objections to this project, with both Mr. Roche and the Chairman wondering how his desire to save trees could be reconciled with his request for more parking. When questioned, Mr. Tobey said the architects intended to do everything possible to prevent tree injury during construction, when damage was most likely to occur, and that injury would not result from underground parking, which would not extend out under the trees. As to the amount of parking provided, he said it would be adequate and would meet zoning requirements. The Chairman explained to Mr. Kieve that the Commission of Fine Arts advises the architect and developer on design only and that the question of parking was a matter for consideration by the zoning board. In regard to Mr. Kieve's statement that the architect had not followed the Commission's recommendation on massing, the Chairman said the Commission had not dictated any new massing but had rather suggested ways in which massing might be altered so as to recoup space lost by lowering the height of the Prospect Street buildings. Mr. Roche felt that Mr. Kieve's suggestion for a different massing and lower height had merit and the architects should give it some consideration. Mr. Nichols, too, thought these buildings should be restudied. The final vote of the Commission was to suspend approval of the submission pending the opportunity to see whether a solution along the lines suggested by Mr. Kieve would bring about an improvement over the submission. The D.C. Government was advised, "Do not issue permit."

3. OG 77-21, 3210 Grace Street, N.W., Renovation and Addition to Existing Buildings for Restaurant and Retail Use - Resubmission. The Assistant Secretary reviewed the Commission's previous action on this project, which had been disapproved with the recommendation that the existing openings in the walls be retained. As resubmitted, this request had been generally complied with, but windows on the second floor facing Grace Street had been altered in a manner not satisfactory to the Georgetown Board. The owners were also requesting permission to change the existing six-over-six sash to single sheet glass. An addition to the project, seen by the Commission for

the first time, was the remodeling of adjacent concrete block buildings which face Grace Street. These would be stuccoed and openings cut for conversion to commercial use. There was no objection to this. The recommendations regarding the main building were that the existing openings should be kept as it, with the exception of the garage door, and the arches not changed. The members had no objection to the use of single sheet glass, although this had been questioned by the Landmarks Committee. The D.C. Government was advised, "Do not issue permit."

4. OG 77-26, 1049 30th Street, N.W., Inn and Office/ Apartment Building - Resubmission. The Assistant Secretary showed a modified design for the traditional inn building and said the architects had considered the suggestions made by the Commission, the Georgetown Board, and the staff, and while some had not worked out others had been incorporated in this new design, which was basically a three-story and dormer building (four stories on the Canal) with a pitched roof smaller in size than that originally presented. This new design had been approved in its general outline by the Georgetown Board, as had that for the contemporary building, although the Board did not see the model, presented for the first time at this Commission meeting.

The architect, Mr. Peter Vercelli, was introduced, and in speaking about the contemporary building said that since the last meeting he had been looking for ways to reduce its impact. The step-back idea used on the 30th Street elevation had now been used on the whole building, the pedestrian movement carried through to 29th Street, and a way found to pull the building back 11-12 feet further from the yards of the houses on 29th Street.

Mr. Chapman asked to comment at this point and said he was still puzzled by the very different design concepts used for the two buildings. He said he thought the apartment building too modern for Georgetown and that he would prefer to see something in between the old and the new. Mr. Roche liked the building, and remarked that "good architecture is always appropriate." He felt that too much mediocre architecture had already been accepted in Georgetown and elsewhere in the interest of accommodation.

The discussion then turned again to the traditional building with several members saying they were still bothered by the design of the doorway. Mr. Nichols thought the arched window over the door was a major source of trouble and suggested that the architect just omit it and use a simple entrance with the two columns shown and a horizontal transom over the door. The members unanimously approved the project in general, with the exception of the doorway. It was expected that the Georgetown Board would review the project again before the issuance of a permit was advised.

5. OG 77-27, 1623 Wisconsin Avenue, N.W., Demolition of Existing Structure and Replacement with Three-Story Commercial Structure. The Assistant Secretary explained that this submission, already seen and disapproved by the Georgetown Board, was for demolition of a house (now used for commercial purposes) and its replacement by a new commercial building of similar size. The owner, Mr. Robert Wolpe, said he was primarily concerned with altering the lower floor and basement, which have been much changed from the original, and so he was advised to return to the Georgetown Board with designs for remodeling these floors rather than demolishing the whole structure. The D.C. Government was advised, "Do not issue permit."

6. OG 77-28, 2800 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W., Hotel/Office/Commercial Building - Final Designs and Material Samples. The Assistant Secretary told the members that the Georgetown Board had approved the working drawings for this project, and then he introduced Mr. David Childs, architect, of Skidmore, Owings & Merrill, who showed samples of the building and paving bricks and the brownstone for the lintels. He said that, actually, concrete colored to resemble brownstone would be substituted because of cost. Mr. Roche questioned the durability of such coloring, but Mr. Childs thought this would not be a problem. He also told the members he would be able to use clear rather than tinted glass for the windows. Other than questioning the durability of the "brownstone" color, there were no objections to the material samples submitted, and the D.C. Government was advised, "Issue permit."

7. OG 77-29, 3222 M Street, N.W. (rear), 3248 M Street, N.W. (rear), 1070 Wisconsin Avenue, N.W., Demolition of Existing Structures. The Assistant Secretary said this was a request for demolition which had been approved by the Georgetown Board. The structures which would be razed are old trolley warehouses and repair buildings in the middle of the block. The plan proposed showed several buildings fronting on M Street and Wisconsin Avenue developed as commercial structures with a new residential complex in the center of the block, replacing the old trolley buildings. The architect, Chloethiel Woodard Smith, was introduced and showed several schematic drawings to explain what was intended, noting that the old stone foundation wall which runs along the Canal would be retained and the new construction placed above it.

The members did not object to the demolition of the old buildings and were enthusiastic about the nature of the proposed development, with the Chairman noting only that he hoped the irregularity characteristic of Georgetown would be retained for the new buildings. Mr. Chapman said that he agreed the buildings slated for demolition were of no particular interest and should be torn down. He suggested that the architect might consider keeping the

trolley tracks which run into one of the M Street buildings as there is a possibility of reviving a trolley line from the George Washington Metro stop to Georgetown, and this might be a good place to store the trolleys and perhaps have a small museum. The D.C. Government was advised, "Issue permit."

8. OG 77-32, 3800 Reservoir Road, N.W., Georgetown University Field House - Preliminary Designs. The Secretary informed the members that this project would be erected on the Georgetown University campus just east of Glover-Archbold Park. He introduced Mr. Dean Price of the University who explained that the field house project would be for intra-mural sports only and was not to be a spectator facility. The building would be mostly underground with a playing field on the roof, and it was pointed out that only a low wall would be seen from public space. The members unanimously approved the project, which will be seen by the Georgetown Board before issuance of a permit is advised.

9. Appendix 1, approved.

Shipstead-Luce Act

Appendix 2, approved.

C. D.C. Department of Housing and Community Development

Historic Subdivisions

Appendix 3, approved.

The meeting was adjourned at 12:45 p.m.

Signed,

Charles H. Atherton

Charles H. Atherton
Secretary

THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS

ESTABLISHED BY CONGRESS MAY 17, 1910

708 JACKSON PLACE, N.W.
WASHINGTON

29 November, 1976

Dear Mike,

At its meeting on November 23, 1976, the Commission had a chance to talk about the reorientation of the "Delta Solar" sculpture to be placed west of the Air-Space Museum. We have no objection to orienting the piece on a diagonal facing the corner of Independence Avenue and 7th Street; with that orientation it will relate to afternoon light in the best possible way, according to the sculptor's wishes. The Commission will be glad to assist you in any final details for the placement or setting of the sculpture.

Sincerely yours,

J. Carter Brown
Chairman

Hon. Michael Collins
Director
National Air and Space Museum
Smithsonian Institution
Washington, D.C. 20560

Exhibit A.

REPORT OF ACTIONS TAKEN ON THE OLD GEORGETOWN ACT

23 November, 1976

NO.	ADDRESS AND OWNER	PROJECT
OG 77-5	3231 Prospect Street, N.W. National Dairy Produce Corporation	New residential, retail, and office complex (resubmission refer to OG 76-212).

ACTION: Do not issue permit. Proposed revision to cornice line and other details of upper story treatment of building abutting Prospect Street on west end of site do not sifficiently reduce effective visual height. Recommend removal of one floor from the six-story apartment building, possibly redistributing the space, if necessary, elsewhere on the site. No additional mass should be added to the west building fronting on N Street. 11/9/76

6	3125 M Street, N.W. Hamburger Hamlet, Incorporated	Remodel existing building to restaurant (resubmission refer to OG 77-1).

ACTION: Do not issue permit. Recommend further study with smaller second floor sash than shown on elevation, maximum height about six feet, and use of some cornice trim similar to that shown on original section. Suggest that full rooftop skylight be used and that glazed standing seam roof facing south be a standard metal roof. Preliminary approval for side elevation. 11/1/76

7	1024 Wisconsin Avenue, N.W. Cherry Hill Associates	Cut into existing building for corridor. Add apartment units at rear (resubmission refer to OG 76-222).

ACTION: Do not issue permit. Preliminary design approved subject to review of working drawings and detailed development, landscape design, and exterior materials. 11/1/76

8	1049 30th Street, N.W. Robert E. Morrison	New proposed hotel, residential, office, and retail development (resubmission refer to OG 76-210).

ACTION: Do not issue permit. Recommend additional material in the form of a model which will show the proposed project and adjacent development across Canal, 29th, and 30th Streets. Full submission of all preliminary design drawings and model will be reviewed by Georgetown Board prior to any approval by full Commission. Recommend additional study for inn structure and consultation with Georgetown Board and Commission staff. Consider using stone below water table on 30th Street and on basement facade along Canal. Recommend that basement entrances and windows be well-proportioned full arches. Recommend an entablature in brick between the first and second floor levels. Recommend refinement of entrance feature on 30th Street. Recommend a substantial cornice at the top of the third floor. Regular, rather than paired, window placement may provide a more traditional facade. Suggest simplification of chimney caps and their incorporation into roof. French doors along first floor may lend a more traditional and satisfactory character than the triple-hung windows. Articulation of window heights on all floors is essential to character desired. Suggest that sash on third floor be smaller in height than sash on second floor. 11/1/76

REPORT OF ACTIONS TAKEN ON THE OLD GEORGETOWN ACT

23 November, 1976

NO.	ADDRESS AND OWNER	PROJECT
OG 77-12	3209-11 M Street, N.W. M Street Associates	Alteration of existing building.
ACTION:	Issue permit. Original window details as seen on western building shall be used on both buildings in renovation. 11/11/76	
13	2813 Olive Street, N.W. Robert Engelen	Entrance wall and window, south wall (resubmission refer to OG 76-193).
ACTION:	Issue permit. 11/17/76	
14	1049 29th Street, N.W. Georgetown Inland East Corporation	Raze masonry garage.
ACTION:	Issue permit. 11/18/76	
16	1335 Wisconsin Avenue, N.W. Cues Courbois	Install walk-in refrigerator (resubmission refer to OG 76-221).
ACTION:	Issue permit for walk-in refrigerator plus new seven-foot-high fence to be installed on building line. 11/4/76	
20	1734 Wisconsin Avenue, N.W. 2-E Enterprises	Non-illuminated plexiglass identification sign; copy: "Make-Up Center, Ltd."
ACTION:	Issue permit. 11/18/76	
23	1248 31st Street, N.W. Michael T. Lambert	New wood fence.
ACTION:	Issue permit. Recommend elimination of top knobs. 11/18/76	

REPORT OF ACTIONS TAKEN ON THE SHIPSTEAD-LUCE ACT

23 November, 1976

NO.	ADDRESS AND OWNER	PROJECT
SL 77-		
2	8112 Beach Drive, N.W. Mr. & Mrs. Blanchard White	Addition off kitchen to be 11'6" x 13'6".
ACTION:	Issue permit for kitchen addition with aluminum siding of "brick" or "barn" red color finish. Trim to be white. 10/26/76	
3	515 15th Street, N.W. GalTex Corporation	Remove existing plastic-faced, V-shaped double-faced sign and replace with 3'6" x 4'6" double-faced aluminum-faced sign with illuminated plastic letters.
ACTION:	Issue permit. 11/10/76	
4	499 South Capitol Street, S.W. Marfair Joint Venture	Brick samples (resubmission refer to SL 76-69).
ACTION:	Materials approved in limestone color range; brick, Skyline Grey and precast concrete #1136. 11/10/76	
5	5196 27th Street, N.W. Covell Builders	Topographical survey with trees 12" or larger shown and model submission for single-family dwelling (resubmission refer to SL 76-73).
ACTION:	Do not issue permit. Proposal for three new dwellings will result in overbuilding this site, removal of trees, and disruption of natural stream valley. These would have an adverse impact on Rock Creek Park and would not be in the public interest. If additional study is to be given new construction on this site, recommend one or two dwellings maximum which would not impact existing terrain of the Park. Party wall construction of two houses may be one satisfactory technique for developing this site. The Commission is available to contact both the Surveyor and the Zoning Office with respect to possible lot changes or zoning variances. 11/10/76	

REPORT OF ACTIONS TAKEN ON HISTORIC SUBDIVISION APPLICATIONS

23 November, 1976

NO.	SQUARE, LOT, ADDRESS AND OWNER	DESCRIPTION
HS 77-12	Square 693, Part Original Lot 13 11 D Street, S.E. William H. Boswell	Conversion of Assessment and Taxation Lot 810 into a record lot prior to submitting plans for an addition to the existing building.
ACTION:	No objection. 11/8/76	
13	Square 1231, Part Original Lot 123 3222-26 O Street, N.W. Michael Arpad	Conversion of Assessment and Taxation Lot 855 into a record lot as the owner plans to build a rear addition to the existing antique shop.
ACTION:	No objection. 11/8/76	